How Zynga Created Performance Analytics for Web Games

David Grunwald Principal Engineer, Zynga

F2P FREE TO PLAY



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM



Principal Engineer Shared Technology Group













Our 56 Million DAU^{*} puts 60 Billion rows of data into our data warehouse every day. *2012 Q4 Earnings report

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Agenda

- What is client performance
- Why we care about performance
- Performance metrics:
 - What's the point of player data
 - Why it's hard
 - What we've done
- How we've matured

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Agenda

• What is client performance

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

What is Performance?

Server Efficiency and Scalability:

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

What is Performance?

Server Efficiency and Scalability:





GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

What is Performance?

Speed of gratification:

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

What is Performance?

Speed of gratification:

Choose your *Prime* shipping speed:

- C FREE Standard Shipping (3-5 business days)
- FREE Two-Day Shipping --get it Wednesday, February 27
- C \$3.99/item One-Day Shipping --get it Tuesday, February 26

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

What is Performance?

Frame Rate:

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

What is Performance?

Frame Rate:



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

What is Performance?

Fidelity:

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

What is Performance?

Fidelity:



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

What is Performance?

Responsiveness:

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

What is Performance?

Responsiveness:





GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Agenda

- What is client performance
- Why we care about performance

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Why does Performance Matter?

Hopefully it makes your players happy!



"Yes! It's great! The news helicopter is finally moving. All of my creepy crypts are popping their lids (in unison). My whales are jumping. Thank you very much."

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Why does Performance Matter?

Hopefully it's good for business



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Free to Play Games

• Where's the money?

 It seems appropriate to assume that more people play a game that loads faster, looks better and and is more responsive...

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Load Time and Retention



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Load Time and Retention



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Revenue and Performance



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

A bone headed hypothesis:

Make performance worse and profits will increase!

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

A bone headed hypothesis:

Make performance worse and profits will increase!

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

An accurate hypothesis:

Player behavior determines performance variability more than anything else.

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Agenda

- What is client performance
- Why we care about performance
- Performance metrics:
 - What's the point of player data

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

What's the point of game metrics?

• Understand your game's reality rather than theory.

- Maintain the quality of your live game.*
- Improve the quality of your live game.*
- * Quickly, efficiently, and predictably.

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Get some top level metrics

- A direct measurement of the player experience
 - Load Time
 - Frame Rate
- Should track the health of the game

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Knowing is half the battle

• You must have the data and tools to understand the root cause of any performance issue.



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Top level performance metrics are insufficient for effecting change

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Agenda

- What is client performance
- Why we care about performance
- Performance metrics:
 - What's the point of player data
 - Why it's hard

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

How Engineers work on bugs

- 1. Reproduce the bug
- 2. What changed in the code?
- 3. What changed in the environment?
- 4. Ask for clarification
- 5. Ask for reproduction case
- 6. Give up

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Reproduce the bug

• Playing the game had a slower framerate today. Go!

• Um...

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

The code changes

- We release new versions of the game multiple times a day.
- Often it's a content release.
- Often there is no change.
- Maybe somebody added an N³ algorithm.

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

The Environment

• We have lots of active (and changing) A/B experiments going on at all times

- What if there's a new Browser release?
- Sundays are different than Mondays

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Clarification?

- Ship new code to get more information
- Build new reporting tools to process said new information
- Sometimes the problem has gone away
- Doesn't inform what has changed

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Getting a reproduction

- Players speak a different language than engineers
- Loading a players world into your own account doesn't necessarily reproduce what they were doing
GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

There's one very likely conclusion

• Give up

 Hope nobody notices that nothing got done for a couple days.



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Agenda

- What is client performance
- Why we care about performance
- Performance metrics:
 - What's the point of player data
 - Why it's hard
 - What we've done

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

You don't need to give up!

good data, good tools.

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

And sometimes a false positive



A:FVTwo-Rel

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Measure the constituent parts



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

The right QA Automation can help

 Loading is easily automated under many common environmental conditions

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

The right QA Automation can help

- Loading is easily automated under many common environmental conditions
- Measure accurate testcases, speak the same metrics, gain credibility



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

QA Automation is hard. Real Hard.

 Can you find a stable yet relevant benchmark for games that release every day?



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Performance Regressions

• With proper data and tools, it is possible to find and fix regressions.

 If you can't stop regressions, you can't hope to improve performance.

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Agenda

- What is client performance
- Why we care about performance
- Performance metrics:
 - What's the point of player data
 - Why it's hard (revisited)

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Improving Performance

• Predictably and efficiently make performance improvements.

... or lose credibility with management

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Experiments are measurement tools



• What if there is no clear winner?

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

The Engineering process

- Investigate / Debug
- Hypothesize
- Implement
- Release
- Measure and Validate
- Repeat

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Find poor performance inducing modules





Adobe Scout

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Then why no impact?

1. The change wasn't an improvement

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Then why no impact?

1. The change wasn't an improvement

2. The change wasn't widely significant

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Then why no impact?

- 1. The change wasn't an improvement
- 2. The change wasn't widely significant
- 3. The change wasn't relevant anymore

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Agenda

- What is client performance
- Why we care about performance
- Performance metrics:
 - What's the point of player data
 - Why it's hard (revisited)
 - What we've done (revisited)

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE[®] 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Measure the right time: Playtime

 10% of sessions had no playtime at all



• Playtime can represent only 60% of the actual session time.

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Production data should encourage the same developer processes

Easily

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Facilitate easy data collection for subsets of the game

 With insight into mini-games, improvement becomes possible

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Facilitate easy data collection for subsets of the game

 With insight into mini-games, improvement becomes possible



GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Focus on the problem to be solved

- Decompose the processing to find the slow modules.
- But only look at the sessions that you want to improve

	percenilie_droup
	P80 group
runtimeModule	avg_module_time
Frame	26,962.85
Actionscript	11,349.78
Preinit	9,120,79
init.execute-WorldInit	4,904.32
ResourceLoader.onComplete	3,118.50
BaseGame.onEngineEnterFrame	1,540.64
ProcessManager.onEnterFrame	1,538.72
GameWorld.createObjects	1,127.57
init.execute-GameSettingsInit	1,025.01
URLResourceLoader.OnInternalComplete	914.78
GameSettingsDownloadInit.OnConfigXmlLoaded	774.73
init.execute-GameSettingsDownloadInit	680.79

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Visualize production data appropriately for the task at hand

• Frame Time = 1000 / Frame Rate

	*Launcher.15.ad8e40c.swf - i	Adobe Scout					
		tr <i>ike</i> ruuraaniat	1) berter under er		History More		
Frame Timeline ×					Summary × Session Info Tra		
Frame Time Memory GP	U Memory Events			17	Ouit Framerate Frames		
Frame Time					10.1 fps Time Target 30.0 fps	1:05.431 - 1:05.629	
					Fra	me Time Memory GPU Memory	
						99 ms	
						97 = 291% of budget 33	
						73	
÷.					DisplayList Rendering	13	
					Network and Video	11	
					► Inactive	2	
						4,183,562 KB	
ومعاراتهم واسترابته الأستار المحيال أنجر بالمحمر	and a line line	in the state of th			Used Memory ActionScript Objects	609,330	
			l		 Bitmap 	151.073	
				×	▶ ByteArrays	124.223	
: ActionScript × DisplayList Rendering Stage3D Rendering					Top Activities : Activity Sequen	e ×	
Top-Down 👻 🗏 S	ampled Time: ActionScript 3 138	ms Total 152 m			G Select a single frame.		
Function	Self Tin	ne (ms) Total	Time (ms)				
Scene3D.enterFrameEvent (flare.basic) BeneinterentManager anDeninterentTimenfilm (farm?) manager		0 0%	53	34%			Total Time (ms
Persistencemanager.onPersistence i imerire (rarm2.managers) EventDisnatcher disnatchEvent (flash events)		0 0%	22	34% 14K			
BaseGame.onEngineEnterFrame		0 0%	17	11%			
InitAssetManager.onTimer (farm2.Init)							
InputManager.onMouseMove <static> (Engine.Managers)</static>							
RuntimeProfiler.onEnterFrame <static> (cipro.Profiler)</static>							

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Decompose Frame Processing

- Frame Times can be decomposed
- Fix the bad modules in the bad frames

runtimeModule	avg_bucket1_frame_time	avg_bucket3_frame_time
Frame	33.76	429.22
Actionscript	9.04	221.14
flare.Scene3D.enterFrameEvent	6.03	66.89
BaseGame.onEngineEnterFrame	1.86	23.56
ProcessManager.onEnterFrame	1.86	23.49
ProcessFrame.EntityManager	0.90	6.98
AssetManager.doWork	0.23	59.86
ProcessFigure. Forrain	0.44	8.30
InputManager.on/viouseMove	0.48	0.89
PersistenceManager.onPersistenceTimerFire	0.07	15.73
ProcessFinite. TooltipManager	0.23	0.23
TweenLite.updateAll	0.15	4.04
ProcessFrame.JobService	0.10	1.13
flare.Flare3DLoader2.nextChunk	0.04	12.67
TimerUtil.callLater	0.00	83.91

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Empower developer innovation

- Don't get in the way
- Let the developers and game code flexibly define the data that is collected
- We rely on manual instrumentation
GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Shared Reporting tools

- No one-off tools required
- Centralize reporting and methodologies

runtimeModule	avg_frame_time		
Frame	88.27	mode	
Actionscript	41.41	Disting	
flare.Scene3D.enterFrameEvent	24.71	Playtime	•
ProcessManager.onEnterFrame	7.54	perceptile are	
BaseGame.onEngineEnterFrame	7.52	percentile_gro	up
AssetManager.doWork	3.72	P80 group	÷
flare.Scene3D.present	3.55	noon data	
ProcessFrame.EntityManager	2.84	zasp_date	
ProcessFrame.Terrain	2.77	3/4/2013	÷,
PersistenceManager.onPersistenceTimerFire	1.43		
TimerUtil.callLater	1.09	game_name	
flare.Flare3DLoader2.nextChunk	0.85	FarmVille 2	\$
InputManager.onMouseMove	0.80		
ProcessFrame.JobService	0.63		
InputManager.onMouseMisc	0.48		
TweenLite.updateAll	0.46		
ProcessFrame.TooltipManager	0.41		
EntityLoadQueue.onParseMoreEntities	0.25		
ProcessFrame.BlobSerializer	0.21		
ProcessFrame.CountdownTimer	0.21		
RuntimeProfiler.FrameProcess	0.12		
MarketDialog.openDialog	0.10		
Module c	ontril	outic /n	n

All Modules (Rows:36 Time:355.73)						
percentile_group	mode	runtimeModule	variant_0_avg_frame_time	variant_1_avg_frame_time	va	
P80 group	Playtime	Frame	93.38	97.47		
P80 group	Playtime	Actionscript	31.19	30.49		
P80 group	Playtime	Viewport.onEnterFrame	9.38	9.59		
P80 group	Playtime	BaseGame.onEngineEnterFrame	9.33	8.87		
P80 group	Playtime	BrobjectPass.draw	8.90	9.11		
P80 group	Playtime	ProcessManager.onFrame	8.85	8.36		
DB0 aroun	Disutimo	BroBondoror onEromo	e e 2	e 99		

Module contribution breakdown by experiment

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Visualization tools can guide analysis techniques



Game vs Game



Mode	Percentile	variant_1_avg_frame_time	variant_2_avg_frame_time	variant_3_avg_frame_time	variant_4_avg_frame_time	variant_5_avg_frame_time
Playtime- PanInactive	0.05	35.39	35.43	36.36	35.42	35.34
Playtime- PanInactive	0.06	35.68	35.73	36.85	35.70	35.58
Playtime- PanInactive	0.07	35.98	36.03	37.33	35.97	35.83
Playtime- PanInactive	0.08	36.27	36.34	37.84	36.22	36.08
Playtime- PanInactive	0.09	36.59	36.68	38.33	36.49	36.33

By Experiment

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Perf Improvements are possible

• Empower engineers to work comfortably and seamlessly with production data.

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Agenda

- What is client performance
- Why we care about performance
- Performance metrics:
 - What's the point of player data
 - Why its hard
 - What we've done
- How we've matured

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Performance maturity is...

- General Manager's care.
- Engineers incorporate data from the field into their workflows.
- PM's & Designers design with an eye towards performance.

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Designing with an eye to perf

• When is consuming performance worth it?







GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Make compromises!



"I just have to say that the snow looks great!"

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25–29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

There are gotchas though

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Don't forget business metrics and player feedback

"Yes! It's great! The news helicopter is finally moving. All of my creepy crypts are popping their lids (in unison). My whales are jumping. Thank you very much."

"Today I have noticed that as I move around I have to wait as my city appears bit by bit."

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM

Things to keep in mind

- Performance matters
- Your players are your workload
- Technical metrics are a tool
- The point is to make a fun and responsive game

GAME DEVELOPERS CONFERENCE® 2013 MARCH 25-29, 2013 GDCONF.COM



dgrunwald@zynga.com